

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In re: :
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, : Docket #1:20-cr-00314-
: GHW All Defendants
Plaintiff, :
- against - :
MELZER, ETHAN PHELAN, : New York, New York
: July 6, 2020
Defendant. :
----- : REMOTE ARRAIGNMENT

PROCEEDINGS BEFORE
THE HONORABLE JUDGE SARAH NETBURN,
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT MAGISTRATE JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For Plaintiff: UNITED STATES ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
BY: SAMUEL S. ADELSBERG, ESQ.
MATTHEW J. C. HELLMAN, ESQ.
One St. Andrew's Plaza
New York, New York 10007
212-637-2278

For the Defendant: FEDERAL DEFENDERS OF NEW YORK INC.
BY: JENNIFER E. WILLIS, ESQ.
JONATHAN MARVINNY, ESQ.
52 Duane Street - 10th Floor
New York, New York 10007
212-417-8743

Transcription Service: Carole Ludwig, *Transcription Services*
155 East Fourth Street #3C
New York, New York 10009
Phone: (212) 420-0771
Email: Transcription420@aol.com

Proceedings conducted telephonically and recorded by
electronic sound recording;
Transcript produced by transcription service

INDEX

E X A M I N A T I O N S

<u>Witness</u>	<u>Direct</u>	<u>Cross</u>	<u>Re-Direct</u>	<u>Re-Cross</u>
----------------	---------------	--------------	------------------	-----------------

None

E X H I B I T S

<u>Exhibit Number</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>ID</u>	<u>In</u>	<u>Voir Dire</u>
-----------------------	--------------------	-----------	-----------	------------------

None

1 PROCEEDINGS 3

2 HONORABLE SARAH NETBURN (THE COURT): Good
3 morning, everybody. This is Judge Netburn.

4 Ms. (indiscernible), are you there?

5 THE CLERK: I'm here, your Honor. Good morning.

6 THE COURT: Good morning. And do we have a court
7 reporter on the call, or you're just recording?

8 THE CLERK: We are recording.

9 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you. Can you call the
10 case?

11 THE CLERK: Your Honor, this is the matter the
12 United States v. Ethan Melzer, 20-cr-314.

13 And starting with the government, would you please
14 state your appearances for the record?

15 MR. SAMUEL S. ADELSBERG: Good morning, your
16 Honor. This is Sam Adelsberg for the United States. And
17 I'm joined by Matt Hellman.

18 THE COURT: Thank you. Good morning.

19 MS. JENNIFER WILLIS: Good morning, your Honor.
20 Jennifer Willis and Jonathan Marvinny, Federal Defenders of
21 New York, on behalf of Mr. Melzer.

22 THE COURT: Thank you. This is a reminder to
23 everybody that this is a public proceeding. Members of the
24 public and the press are able to access the proceeding
25 through the public call-in number. And all participants

1 PROCEEDINGS 4
2 are reminded that any recording or rebroadcasting of any
3 portion of this proceeding is strictly prohibited.

4 Can I just confirm, can the government hear me
5 adequately?

6 MR. ADELSBERG: Yes, your Honor.

7 THE COURT: Okay. And, Ms. Willis, can you hear
8 me okay?

9 MS. WILLIS: I can, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: Thank you. And, Mr. Melzer, I just
11 want to confirm that you can hear me.

12 MR. ETHAN MELZER (THE DEFENDANT): Yes, Judge; I
13 can hear you.

14 THE COURT: Okay. If for any reason you should
15 have difficulty hearing me, please speak up and let me
16 know, okay?

17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge.

18 THE COURT: Okay. Okay. I understand that we are
19 here today for an arraignment, is that correct?

20 MR. ADELSBERG: Yes, your Honor.

21 THE COURT: As everyone knows, we're in the middle
22 of the COVID-19 pandemic. I hope everybody on this call is
23 healthy and safe. I'm conducting this proceeding remotely
24 pursuant to the authority provided by Section 15002 of the
25 CARES Act and the standing orders issued by our chief judge

1 PROCEEDINGS

5

2 pursuant to that act.

3 I find that the use of video conferencing at this
4 time is not reasonably available; and, therefore, it's
5 necessary to proceed by telephone. I am proceeding by
6 telephone, and I myself am outside of the district.

7 Mr. Melzer, I've already confirmed that you can
8 hear me and asked that you let me know if you have any
9 difficulty hearing me. I also want to let you know that if
10 you would like to speak privately with your attorney at any
11 time, just let me know, and we will give you that
12 opportunity, okay?

13 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge.

14 THE COURT: Okay. I've received a signed
15 Waiver -- actually not signed -- of Consent to Waive
16 Physical Presence. Ms. Willis, I have this form. It has
17 your client's name typed, but it hasn't been signed. Have
18 you had an opportunity to discuss this form with him?

19 MS. WILLIS: I did, your Honor. This morning, in
20 advance of the call, I was able -- Mr. Marvinny and I were
21 both able to speak to Mr. Melzer. We did discuss with him
22 the fact that today's proceeding would be happening
23 obviously remotely and also by phone, and we did review
24 both the waivers with him. It was my understanding that
25 the Court would be able to fill it out -- not fill it

1 PROCEEDINGS 6
2 out -- rather would be able to sign on his behalf with his
3 consent.

4 THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Melzer, is all of that
5 correct?

6 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge.

7 THE COURT: And do you continue to wish to waive
8 your rights to be physically present and instead proceed by
9 telephone?

10 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge. Yes, Judge.

11 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

12 And from the government, anything further before I
13 make my finding?

14 MR. ADELSBERG: No, your Honor. Thank you.

15 THE COURT: Thank you.

16 I find that at knowing and voluntary waiver of the
17 right to be physically present for this arraignment has
18 been made. I also find that today's proceeding cannot be
19 further delayed without serious harm to the interests of
20 justice. And, therefore, we will proceed by telephone.

21 Mr. Melzer, do you authorize me to electronically
22 sign your name on this waiver of the right to be present at
23 a criminal proceeding?

24 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge.

25 THE COURT: Thank you. And I've also received

PROCEEDINGS

7

2 from you a Consent to Proceed by Video of Teleconference.
3 Did you receive that form, as well, or have you discussed
4 that form with your lawyer?

THE DEFENDANT: We discussed it, Judge.

6 THE COURT: Okay. And may I electronically sign
7 this form on your behalf, as well?

8 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge.

9 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

As I mentioned, we are here for an arraignment.
Mr. Melzer, you've been charged in a six-count indictment.
I'm going to go over those counts briefly with you.
Count 1 charges you with conspiracy to murder U.S. nationals. That's a violation of Title 18 of the United States Code Section 2332(b) and 3238. Count 2 charges you with attempted murder of U.S. nationals. That's a violation of Title 18 of the United States Code Sections 2332(b), 3238, and 2. Count 3 charges you with conspiracy to murder U.S. service members. That's a violation of Title 18 of the United States Code Section 1114, 1117, and 3238. Count 4 charges you with attempted murder of U.S. service members. That's a violation of Title 18 of the United States Code Sections 1114, 3238, and 2. Count 5 charges you with the provision and attempted provision of material support to terrorists. That's a violation of

1 PROCEEDINGS 8
2 Title 18 of the United States Code Section 2339-A(a), 3238,
3 and 2. And Count 6 charges you with conspiracy to murder
4 and maim in a foreign country. And that is a violation of
5 Title 18 of the United States Code, Sections 956(a)(1),
6 956(a)(2)(A), and 3238.

7 Mr. Melzer, have you received a copy of this
8 indictment?

9 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge.

10 THE COURT: And have you had an opportunity to
11 discuss the charges with your lawyer?

12 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, Judge.

13 THE COURT: I've gone over the six counts of the
14 indictment, but if you'd like, I can read the entire
15 indictment to you in open court. Would you like me to read
16 it to you?

17 THE DEFENDANT: No, thank you, Judge.

18 THE COURT: And how do you plead to the charges?

19 THE DEFENDANT: Not guilty, Judge.

20 THE COURT: Thank you. I'll enter a plea of not
21 guilty on your behalf.

22 Anything further from the government?

23 MR. ADELSBERG: No, your Honor.

24 THE COURT: And, Ms. Willis, anything further from
25 defense?

1

PROCEEDINGS

9

2

MS. WILLIS: No, your Honor. Thank you.

3

THE COURT: Okay. Thank you, everybody. We're
4 adjourned.

5

MR. ADELSBERG: Thank you, Judge.

6

(Whereupon, the matter is adjourned.)

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3 C E R T I F I C A T E
4

5 I, Carole Ludwig, certify that the foregoing
6 transcript of proceedings in the case of USA v. Ethan P.
7 Melzer, Docket #20-cr-00314-GHW All Defendants, was
8 prepared using digital transcription software and is a true
9 and accurate record of the proceedings.

10

11

12

13 Signature Carole Ludwig

14 Carole Ludwig

15 Date: July 7, 2020

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25